Newburyport Historical Commission

February 27, 2019 City Council Chambers Minutes

1. Call to Order

Acting Chair Stephen Dodge called a regular meeting of the Newburyport Historical Commission to order at 7:31 p.m.

2. Roll Call

In attendance were members Stephen Dodge, Christopher Fay, Ron Ziemba and Malcolm Carnwath. Glenn Richards, Ned McGrath and Sarah White were absent.

3. General Business

Davis Simpson, Maria & Ryan Lachapelle 5 Olive Street Roofline Change

Lisa Mead represented the applicant and described the proposed changes to a two-family structure. The commission members determined at the January 23 meeting that the structure is historically significant. No changes would be made to the front historic portion of the house. The rear addition would be extended and this extension would be visible from the street when viewed down the driveway. Attorney Mead said a corner board has been added since the last meeting and the ridgeline of the addition is lower than that of the original structure.

The hearing was opened to comments from the public. No one spoke in support of the plans. Tom Kolterjahn, 64 Federal Street, spoke in opposition to the proposal. He said an addition should not be the dominant feature of a structure and the plans could be improved. The public comment portion of the hearing was closed.

Christopher Fay said he agrees with the comments made by Mr. Kolterjahn. He said the addition would not improve the historic structure and would in fact detract from it.

Stephen Dodge moved to accept the plans as presented. Ron Ziemba seconded the motion. The motion was approved with Christopher Fay voting against it.

Ted Nelson 190 High Street Preservation Restriction

Ted Nelson presented the revised preservation restriction being placed on the main structure and carriage house as a part of a Section 6(C) permit from the Planning Board. Stephen Dodge moved to accepted the revised preservation restriction as presented. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Newburyport Historical Commission February 27, 2019

Art Murphy, Perry Murphy Construction 7 Prospect Street DOD Advisory Review

The applicant is proposing to remove the existing wood windows from a Greek Revival structure and replace them with vinyl ones with simulated divided lights.

Comments from the public were accepted. Tom Kolterjahn, 64 Federal Street, said he believes the windows are original to the structure, which is largely intact. He said the windows should be preserved and it is a myth that replacing windows is the best way to conserve energy.

Malcolm Carnwath said the structure is an important piece of American architecture. He is opposed the use of vinyl windows and said most heat is lost through the roof of a structure. Stephen Dodge said the structure is located in the overlay district, in which the historical commission is charged with preserving as much as possible.

Christopher Fay moved to recommend the windows be restored. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Grant Lewis 4-6 Bromfield Street DCOD Advisory Review

John Sava represented the applicant, who is proposing to expand the existing structure to the north and west and raise its roofline.

Comments from the public were accepted. Tom Kolterjahn, 64 Federal Street, said the proposal would result in the loss of the original building. The Palladian window would not be appropriate for the structure. He said some of the windows appear to be Federal and if they are to be replaced, they should not be discarded. He suggested the addition of living space could be achieved through the use of two gambrel roofs. Stephanie Niketic, 93 High Street, said the ganged windows have a modern appearance and are not appropriate for the structure.

Malcolm Carnwath said the proposal would drastically alter the proportions of the building. Stephen Dodge said converting the building to a saltbox would be in keeping with other structures in the neighborhood. He moved to advise that the plans be changed to that of a saltbox and the original ridgeline be retained. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

4. Minutes

Ron Ziemba moved to approve the minutes of the February 13, 2019, meeting as submitted. Stephen Dodge seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

5. Adjournment

Malcolm Carnwath moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:00 p.m. Ron Ziemba seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.