Newburyport Historical Commission

Mayor's Conference Room October 11, 2017 Minutes

1. Call to Order

Chair Sarah White called a regular meeting of the Newburyport Historical Commission to order at 7:32 p.m.

2. Roll Call

In attendance were members Sarah White, Malcolm Carnwath, Stephen Dodge, Ned McGrath and Mark Bilodeau.

3. General Business

Plum Island, LLC

79 Parker Street

Advisory Review

The Commission members confirmed the Greek Revival farmhouse is historically significant and determined they would not oppose the demolition of the 20th century barn. The plans were changed based on the comments made at the August 23 meeting. The Commission members were in agreement on the following:

- modern materials, while appropriate for additions and new construction, would not be acceptable for the historic structure. A metal roof should not be added to the existing structure but may be used on the new barn.
- the style of the windows should be consistent throughout the house and would be preferably two over two.
- single dormers with gable roofs should be used on the front of the house. The double-window dormer and flat roofs would not be acceptable.
- a solid wood six-panel door should be used at the front entrance rather than the full glass door that was proposed.

The members discussed the importance of the farmhouse as a reminder of the history of the area, which is now an industrial park. The proposed design of the addition and new building were acceptable to three of the members, while two would prefer a more traditional look. Sarah White moved to issue an advisory report to the Planning Board listing the elements that must be revised and expressing the majority and minority opinions on the design of the addition and new building.

Mark Wojcicki

158-160 State Street

Preservation Restriction

Nick Cracknell represented the applicant, who is placing a preservation restriction on a house as a part of a 6(C) special permit from the Planning Board that allow the construction of three townhouses at the rear of the property. The Commission members asked that language be added to the restriction requiring that all future additions shall be subordinated to the historic structure with regards to volume, footprint, placement and height. They also requested it be made clear that the restriction guidelines apply to exterior elements only. The section on major alterations to

Newburyport Historical Commission October 11, 2017

exterior features would be revised to read, "inappropriate removal of historic elements." The language will also be altered to indicate the Commission must approve major alterations and in addition to reviewing them. The elevating or moving of the structure shall be included as actions requiring approval. The Commission members discussed the duration of the preservation restriction, which was proposed as being 30 years. The length is not specified in the ordinance, which should perhaps be amended. The applicant would not oppose a permanent restriction but would wish to consult an attorney.

Sarah White moved to approve the draft preservation restriction with the amendments discussed and with the stipulation that pending a final review by the applicant's legal council the applicant would agree to modify the terms of the restriction to perpetuity and anything less would require review and approval by the Commission. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

The applicant wishes to make some minor alterations to the historic structure. Sarah White moved to allow the replacement of the concrete steps on the side of the structure with wood. Mark Bilodeau seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Sarah White moved to allow the replacement of the bay window on the 1987 addition at the rear of the structure with three one-over-one vinyl clad windows. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Sarah White moved to allow the replacement of the windows on the original structure with two-over-two wood windows with simulated divided lights and spacer bars and trim that matches the existing trim on the front of the structure. Mark Bilodeau seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Michael Graf

8 Harrison Street Demolition Delay

The structure, which is outside of the DCOD and DOD, was originally a gambrel with a central chimney. An addition was constructed in 2002 and the roofline was changed. The applicant wishes to remove the portion of the structure that was added in 2002. The Commission members were not in agreement on the historical significance of the structure due to the alterations that had been made. It would be considered historically significant under the ordinance due to its age. A site visit will take place. Sarah White moved the structure is historically significant. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a three to two vote, with Ned McGrath and Stephen Dodge voting against it.

Berkeley Investments, Inc.

1690 House, 262 Merrimac Street

Restoration Plan

Lisa Mead represented the applicant. A restoration plan has been submitted to the Massachusetts Historical Commission. Based on MHC comments, the plan was revised and resubmitted. The applicant is seeking comments from the NHC to be forwarded to MHC. The details of the restoration plan were reviewed. New elements will be fabricated to match the original one. Custom-made, six-panel doors will be installed. The doors will be made taller to meet the entablature, which will be replaced. The sidelights will be made narrower and the pilasters will

Newburyport Historical Commission October 11, 2017

be improved. Shutters of an appropriate size will be installed in their original locations. The windows that have been installed will be removed and a return to the original proportions will be made. The Indian shutters will be installed in a single room and will be made operable. On north elevation the entablature will be replaced on the two third-floor windows.

Sarah White moved to provisionally accept the preservation restriction containing the restoration plan dated September 28, 2017, with a final review and vote to be taken after MHC comments have been received. Mark Bilodeau seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

The Commission members discussed condition #11 of the 2015 Planning Board special permit. This condition required that prior to the demolition of the house on the interior, a list of elements not to be preserved would be given to the City and the Preservation Trust and these items were to be made available to them. Bonnie Sontag, chair of the Planning Board, said condition #11 is a Planning Board issue and the lack of adherence to the condition was significant. The Planning Board decided mitigation would be necessary and asked for NHC input on two actions. These would be the installation of interpretive signage on the significance of the Samuel Morse House and its interior elements and a perpetual preservation restriction on the historically significant features of Towle Manufacturing building. The Commission will review the proposal for the interpretive signage at the October 25 meeting and will report to the Planning Board for its November 1 meeting.

David Pierre, West Row Café and Bar

35 Market Square

DOD Advisory Review

The applicant plans to open a restaurant at 35 Market Square. Brickwork was done with modern brick and mortar of the wrong color. The joints are very wide and it does not appear lime mortar was used. On Inn Street an arch was filled in with brick. While this action alone was not of special concern to the Commission members, the use of inappropriate mortar was. Because it would be necessary to remove the bricks to replace the mortar, it was recommended that a dark-colored, solid wood, non-functioning door be installed instead. The fanlight could also be filled with wood. At the rear of the structure, which will be a service entrance, the doorway was moved and lowered and a glass door was installed. A replacement for the glass door was discussed but the applicant may retain it if he desires. It was recommended Richard Irons be contacted regarding the brickwork.

Sarah White moved to advise the Planning Board that a dark-colored, solid wood, non-functioning door with a wood-filled fanlight be installed in the arch on Inn Street and at the rear of the structure the inappropriate brick be replaced with Federal-period brick with lime mortar and appropriately sized joints. Mark Bilodeau seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Michael Cyros

6 Purchase Street

DOCD Advisory Review

The applicant purchased a window to be installed above the main door. It was found an upright beam would prevent the use of this window. The applicant is now proposing to use it on the rear

Newburyport Historical Commission October 11, 2017

of the structure. A blind window will be installed over the main door on the front of the structure. Mark Bilodeau moved to allow the use of the window in the alternate location. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

4. Minutes

Stephen Dodge moved to approve the minutes of the August 23, 2017 meeting as submitted. Malcolm Carnwath seconded the motion. The motion was approved.

5. Adjournment

Malcolm Carnwath moved to adjourn the meeting at 10:34 p.m. Stephen Dodge seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.